

Journal of Consciousness Studies

controversies in science & the humanities

Vol. 18, No. 5–6, May/June 2011

Consciousness, Life, & the Enactive Approach

edited by Tobias Schlicht

3 About Authors

000 Editorial Preface

Tobias Schlicht

Target Paper

000 Précis of *Mind in Life*

Evan Thompson

Commentaries

000 Shall We Tango? No, but Thanks for Asking *Daniel C. Dennett*

000 The Limitations of a Purely Enactive
(Non-Representational) Account of Imagery *Lucia Foglia & Rick Grush*

000 Philosophy of Mind's New Lease on Life:
Autopoietic Enactivism meets Teleosemiotics *Daniel D. Hutto*

000 Merits & Limits of a Philosophy of Autopoiesis *Albert Newen*

000 Life in Mind *Susan Oyama*

000 Mind in Life, Mind in Process: Toward a New Transcendental
Aesthetic & a New Question of Panpsychism *John Protevi*

000 Embodied Consciousness & the Explanatory Gap *Charles Siewert*

000 Life, Holism & Emergence:
Converging Themes *Robert Van Gulick*

000 Mind in Life or Life in Mind? Making Sense of
Deep Continuity *Michael Wheeler*

000 Mutual Enlightenment & Transcendental Thought *Dan Zahavi*

Reply from Evan Thompson

000 Reply to Commentators

Evan Thompson

Published in the UK and USA by Imprint Academic, PO Box 200,
Exeter EX5 5YX, UK

World Copyright © Imprint Academic, 2011. No part of any contribution may be reproduced in any form without permission, except for the quotation of brief passages in criticism and discussion. The opinions expressed in the articles and book reviews are not necessarily those of the editors or the publishers.

JCS is indexed and abstracted in: *Social Sciences Citation Index*[®], *ISI Alerting Services* (includes *Research Alert*[®]), *Current Contents*[®]: *Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *Arts and Humanities Citation Index*[®], *Current Contents*[®]: *Arts & Humanities Citation Index*[®], *Social Scisearch*[®], *PsycINFO*[®] and *The Philosopher's Index*.

ISSN 1355 8250

Journal of Consciousness Studies

Editor

Valerie Gray Hardcastle, Dean of McMicken College of Arts and Sciences,
University of Cincinnati. valerie.hardcastle@uc.edu

Managing Editor (address for submissions)

Graham Horswell, Imprint Academic, PO Box 200, Exeter EX5 5YX, UK
graham.jcs@gmail.com

Book Reviews Editor (address for books for review)

Julian Kiverstein, Department of Philosophy, University of Edinburgh,
George Square, Edinburgh, EH8 9JX, UK. J.Kiverstein@ed.ac.uk

Associate Editors

Jean Burns: jeanbur@earthlink.net; **Anthony Freeman**: anthony.jcs@gmail.com
Ivo Mosley (Poetry): ivomosley@aol.com; **Chris Nunn**: cmhnunn@btinternet.com

Founding Editors

Joseph A. Goguen (1941–2006), **Robert K.C. Forman**: Forman@TheForge.org
Jonathan Shear: jcs@infionline.net, **Keith Sutherland**, Publisher: keith@imprint.co.uk

Editorial Advisory Board

Bernard J. Baars, Neurosciences Institute; **David Chalmers**, Australian National University; **Ewert Cousins**, Fordham University; **Daniel Dennett**, Tufts University; **Margaret Donaldson**, Edinburgh University; **Peter Fenwick**, Maudsley Hospital; **Stuart Hameroff**, University of Arizona; **Erich Harth**, Syracuse University; **Basil Hiley**, Birkbeck College; **Nicholas Humphrey**, London School of Economics; **Piet Hut**, Institute for Advanced Studies; **Robert Kentridge**, University of Durham; **Christof Koch**, CalTech; **George Lakoff**, UC, Berkeley; **Philip Merikle**, University of Waterloo; **Mary Midgley**, University of Newcastle; **Raimon Panikkar**, UC, Santa Barbara; **Roger Penrose**, Oxford University; **Geraint Rees**, Institute of Cognitive Neuroscience; **Eleanor Rosch**, UC, Berkeley; **David Rosenthal**, CUNY; **John Searle**, UC, Berkeley; **Huston Smith**, Syracuse University; **Susan Leigh Star**, Santa Clara University; **Roger Walsh**, UC, Irvine; **Arthur Zajonc**, Amherst College.

Manuscript Submissions

For style guide and other directions for authors go to the journal's website,
imprint-academic.com/jcs

Subscription and Ordering Information

Annual Subscription Rates for 2011 (12 monthly issues):

Individuals: \$154/£77 **Institutions:** \$560/£280

Prices for print journal and include accelerated delivery (UK/USA), surface mail rest of world, and free access to the journal online at Ingenta.com

Orders to : Imprint Academic, PO Box 200, Exeter EX5 5YX, UK.

Tel: +44 1392 851550; Fax: 851178; Email: sandra@imprint.co.uk

Cheques (£ or \$US 'Imprint Academic'); VISA/AMEX/MASTERCARD

 imprint-academic.com

ABOUT AUTHORS

Daniel C. Dennett is Co-Director of the Centre for Cognitive Studies and Austin B. Fletcher Professor of Philosophy at Tufts University. He is the author of numerous publications in the philosophy of mind and cognitive science, including *Content & Consciousness*, *Consciousness Explained*, *Darwin's Dangerous Idea*, and, most recently, *Sweet Dreams*.

Lucia Foglia is Visiting Post-Doctoral Fellow UCSD at Università di Siena, Italy.

Rick Grush is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California in San Diego. He has widely published on topics in the philosophy of mind, cognitive science, and especially on mental representation.

Daniel D. Hutto is Professor of Philosophical Psychology at the University of Hertfordshire. His numerous publications on topics in the philosophy of mind include *Beyond Physicalism* (2000) and *Folk-Psychological Narratives* (2008). He is currently working on a co-authored book (with Erik Myin, Antwerp) entitled *Radicalizing Enactivism*.

Albert Newen is Professor of Philosophy at Ruhr-Universität Bochum (Germany). His focus is on the philosophy of mind and language. He has authored and edited numerous books and special issues of journals like *Consciousness & Cognition* and *Erkenntnis*, and published over 100 articles on topics from these areas.

Susan Oyama is Professor of Psychology, Emerita, at the John Jay College of Criminal Justice, and at The Graduate School and University Center, both of CUNY in New York City. Her main research interests are the concepts of development, evolution, and genetic information, as well as the nature/nurture opposition, and she has written extensively on Developmental Systems Theory.

John L. Protevi is Professor in the Department of French Studies at Louisiana State University in Baton Rouge. His books include *Political Affect: Connecting the Social & the Somatic* (2009), *Political Physics: Deleuze, Derrida & the Body Politic* (2001), and *Time & Exteriority: Aristotle, Heidegger, Derrida* (1994).

Tobias Schlicht is Professor of Philosophy at Ruhr-Universität Bochum (Germany) and Leader of a Junior Research Group on the

Philosophy of Consciousness and Cognition. Apart from this edition, he is currently editing a collection of papers on issues in the context of teleology, called *Zweck und Natur* (to appear in German in 2011).

Charles Siewert is Professor of Philosophy at Rice University, Houston. He has worked extensively on consciousness and intentionality, especially in his book *The Significance of Consciousness* (1998).

Evan Thompson is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Toronto, Canada. He works in the areas of cognitive science, phenomenology, and philosophy of mind. With Francisco Varela and Eleanor Rosch he co-authored *The Embodied Mind: Cognitive Science and Human Experience* (MIT Press, 1991). His book *Mind in Life: Biology, Phenomenology, and the Sciences of Mind* (Harvard University Press), to which this issue is devoted, was published in 2007. In 2010 it won the Edwin Ballard Prize awarded by the Center for Advanced Research in Phenomenology for an outstanding book in phenomenology. He is also the author of *Colour Vision: A Study in Cognitive Science and the Philosophy of Perception* (Routledge Press, 1995), and is co-editor of *The Cambridge Handbook of Consciousness*.

Robert Van Gulick is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Cognitive Science Program at Syracuse University. He has published on a variety of topics in the philosophy of mind including consciousness, externalism, intentional content, reduction, emergence, and mental causation.

Michael Wheeler is a Professor of Philosophy at the University of Stirling. His primary research interests are in philosophy of science (especially cognitive science, psychology, biology, artificial intelligence, and artificial life) and philosophy of mind. He also works on Descartes and Heidegger and is currently completing a book called *Extended X: Recarving the Biological and Cognitive Joints of Nature*, covering issues surrounding the extended mind thesis.

Dan Zahavi is Director of the Danish National Research Foundation: *Center for Subjectivity Research*, and Professor of Philosophy at the University of Copenhagen. He has published numerous books and articles on phenomenological themes and thinkers, including *Self-Awareness & Alterity* (1999) and *Subjectivity & Selfhood: Investigating the First-Person Perspective* (2008).